

APPEAL NO. E261-04/2022

Muhammad Israr

Vs

COMSATS University, Islamabad

Fawad Malik: Information Commissioner

**A. APPEAL**

1. Mr. Muhammad Israr, former employee of COMSATS University filed an online appeal before the Pakistan Commission on access to Information, Islamabad complaining therein that his complaint on the citizen's portal against complaint number IS180322-89872829 dated 18-03-2022 against Secretary, Information and Broadcasting has not been responded. In the appeal the appellant has requested the following information:

- a. *“Provide advertisements on which COMSATS and Ministry MOST got 400 Canals land from CDA.*
- b. *Total money transmitted to CDA by COMSATS University bank statement.*
- c. *Fourth senate standing committee for COMSATS University six orders has been passed all orders attested copy and signed by President of Pakistan along without senate member those are 1 Adleeb Abbass No-2 Rukhsana Zubairi.*
- d. *Original appraisal forms of applicant from 2012 to 2015 dully attested and approved by Dr. Muhammad Amin who was HOD EE department and signed by Present director COMSATS WAH with stamped and signature.*
- e. *The letter of appointments on which the services has been regularized not job regularization letter but contract letters of Jawwad Ahmad additional registrar and DY registrar Adnan Karim with Dy Librarian Farhad Ali and six more:*

APPEAL NO. E261-04/2022

- *EE depts. Mazhar Adnan lab staff*

- *Rashid Javed lab Attended*
- *Nazakat Ali lab attendant*
- *Khawar Lab Assistant*
- *Khalid Aziz lab assistant*
- *Israr lab assistant*

*All job confirmation letters*

*Last salaries slips and letter on which job confirmed not job regularization notification (contract letters required with job confirmation letters who contract letters jis kay base pur job confirm ho chuki) strict compliance.*

- f. Advertisement of lease land received by COMSATS WAH from PoF in 2003*
- g. Bank statement transmitted to POF on behalf of lease land.*
- h. COMSATS WAH Cantt got 160 Canals from Chodhri Qamar Complete bank statement.*
- i. Attested copy of registrar Sajjad Madni Appointment being Registrar Acting base Charge holder.*
- j. Land purchased from Snofi Aventis complete bank transmitted statement and NOC from Army Directorate.*
- k. Notification of Habib Bukhari his name was approved in 4<sup>th</sup> senate meeting was held in January 2021.*
- l. Notification of Dr. Abid being Acting Charge holder who was appointed after Dr. Habib Bukhari selected in Murree University.*
- m. Promotion dates of the following employees to next grades Naveed Ahmad Khan Additional Registrar and Jawwad Ahmad Additional registrar Comsats WAH with DY registrar Adnan Karim along with Dy Librarian Farhad Ali.*
- n. Reinstatement letter of Basit Paracha who was neighbour of Shibli Faraz in Comsats Islamabad services department under Col Aftab.,*
- o. One year bank statement in HBL Comsats Islamabad of Basit Paracha who was reinstated.*
- p. Complete bank statement of Naveed Ahmad Khan who is Additional Registrar of UPS HQs Comsats principle seat Islamabad from the year 2022 to 2022.*
- q. Complete bank statement of Additional Registrar Jawwad Ahmad COMSATS WAH of Askari Bank No 2 Allied Bank No 3 Alfalah Bank in WAH Cantt from date of appointment to 2022.*

APPEAL NO. E261-04/2022

- r. *All appointment letters of Applicant from 2005 to 2017 dully attested by Registrar Jawwad Ahmad and Director COMSATS WAH.*
- s. *All record of pension issued to employees as per pension Statue 2010 and money had fixed 928.811 million Rupees.*
- t. *All record disbursement of 9328.811 million rupees issued to employees.*
- u. *All funding record received from HEC Ministry of MOST and direct from national treasure positively not to conceal single rupee.”*

2. Earlier he filed an application dated nill for the provision of the following information:

1. *“All Senate meetings from 1 to 6<sup>th</sup> dully signed by President of Pakistan and Rukhshana Zubairy and Adleeb Abbass.*
2. *Newspaper complete on which COMSATS University and MOST ministry received 500 canals land on lease with due process and competitive process if not did so then how they violated article 9 and 26 of the Constitution.*
3. *Notification of Dr. Habib Bukhari who was selected in 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of senate had held in January 2021 and how did kept secret and nominated permanent director Dr Abid if investigated both from similar place of permanent address.”*

## **B. PROCEEDINGS**

3. In response to the notice of the Commission the Additional Registrar, COMSATS University, Islamabad, Wah Campus vide letter dated 30<sup>th</sup> May, 2022 filed the reply to the appeal. The point wise response to the appeal is reproduced hereunder:

- a. *“No advertisement was made. The land was allotted by the CDA after approval of the Chief Executive of Pakistan.*
- b. *Rs. 166.642 million*
- c. *There is no Senate Standing Committee exists within CUI system.*
- d. *The decision of annual appraisal is already provided to the applicant vide letter No. CIITW-3(60)-214 dated April 12, 2018. (Flag-A)*
- e. *No separate letters of appointment issued to the employees upon job regularization. Only letters of confirmation (extended contracts until superannuation) where issued to the employees as per Employees Service Statutes 2009 clause-22.*

APPEAL NO. E261-04/2022

- Salary slips of other employees cannot be provided to the applicant as these documents lied under section -7 clause-g of RTI Act 2017.*
- f. *No advertisement was published and not required to lease agreement with Pakistan Ordinance Factories (POFs). The buildings are handed over by the POFs to CUI on 20years lease in 2003 for educational purposes and a monthly rent is being paid to the POFs.*
  - g. *Documents lied under section-7, clause-h of RTI Act 2017 and not be provided to the applicant.*
  - h. *Copy of notification is attached (flag-B)*
  - i. *The decision of appointment was notified vide CUI's Notification No.CUI-Reg(M)/Senate-04(4)21/621 dated February 25, 2021 (Flag-C)*
  - j. *Prof. Dr. Muhammad Abid was appointed as a Director CUI wah Campus. Copy of notification is attached. (Flag-D)*
  - k. *Naveed Ahmad Khan, Additional Registrar has never been promoted in CUI rather he was appointed in OG-II grade through advertisement dated j11.06.2004 and in OG-III dated 08.08.2011. Dr. Jawwad Ahmad promoted as Additional Registrar w.e.f 11.01.2018l Adnan Karim promoted as Deputy Registrar w.e.f 01.07.2016 Farhad Ali promoted as Deputy Librarian w.e.f 11.04.2011.*
  - l. *His contract was extended vide CUI-HR/PF-1182/2008/21-6040 dated June 4, 2021 (Flag-E)*
  - m. *Documents lies under section-7, clause-g of RTI Act 2017 and not be provided to the applicant.*
  - n. *Already provided to the applicant vide letter No. CIITW-3(60)-214 dated April 12, 2018. (flag-F)*
  - o. *82 employees are drawing pension up till now. (flag-G)*
  - p. *Total disbursement from 2010-11 to 2021-22 is Rs. 175 million. (flag-H)*
  - q. *HEC: Rs.14.852 billion  
MoST: Rs. 994.355 million."*

4. The appellant although has been provided point wise information and record asked in the appeal but still he has supplemented to the appeal to the following effect:

- i. *The applicant filed case under E-261 further case has been filed under number E-287 which is under consideration case No. E-261 was fixed for hearing on 01-06-2022. Applicant got some ambiguity in documents **WITHOUT AFFIDAVIT CERTIFICATE** which is mandatory as per information commission Act clause 13(3).*
- ii. *The Rector COMSATS University and director COMSATS WAH may kindly be directed to represent the case in person because the matter is not minor but the matter involve serious*

APPEAL NO. E261-04/2022

*allegations of applicant against rector COMSATS and Director COMSATS WAH with Chairman CDA and Chairman NTS.*

- iii. *Chairman CDA may kindly be directed to issue complete bank statement received huge amount whether it is 395 – 373 or 166 million Rupees? CDA from COMSATS University on the basis of 42.4 Acres of land on lease in the year 2002 and 2006 for the year 33 year make sure this is not 42.7 Acres but this is exactly 50 Acres land.*
- iv. *Chairman HEC may kindly be directed to issue complete funding record issued to COMSATS Varsity from 2005 to 2017 with bank statement.*
- v. *Chairman NTS may kindly be directed to issue land record either received from CDA or COMSATS Varsity and complete money trail without any abuses document theft lost or stolen is mandatory.*
- vi. *Is this not record of Naveed Ahmad Khan the Additional Registrar made refuse in case No. E261.*

<i>Appointment letter to 2002 to 2004 salary 23600 rupees</i>	<i>2004 to 2006 salaries 32400</i>	<i>2011 to 2013 Salary 123-482</i>
<i>2012 – 2013 Salaries 137 – 561</i>	<i>Salary slip Jan 2018 157 – 095</i>	<i>Appointment Letter 2018 to 2022 speaks salary 216 – 597 signed by Sahib Khalil ur Rehman</i>

- vii. *Job confirmation letters of employees already part of Case No. 261 of junior employees may kindly be provided.*

5. The copies of supplement to appeal were also sent to the Chairman, CDA, chairman HEC, chairman NTS who were not party in the appeal.

### **C. COMMISSION'S VIEW**

6. The appellant has expanded the appeal manifold as compared to his request. The public body has comprehensively and properly answered each and every item of the request and provided the copies of all the documents mentioned in the response.

7. The appellant cannot be permitted to supplement the appeal with additional requests and to further expand the number of the public bodies.

**D. ORDER**

8. The appeal is disposed of.

.

Mohammad Azam  
Chief Information Commissioner

Fawad Malik  
Information Commissioner

Zahid Abdullah  
Information Commissioner  
Announced on 04.08.2022

Certified that this order consists of 06 pages, each page has been read and signed