



In The Pakistan Information Commission, Islamabad

Appeal No 674-10/20

Muhammad Sohail

(Appellant)

Vs.

Allama Iqbal Open University

Through its Public Information Officer

(Respondent)

ORDER

Date: April 14, 2021

Zahid Abdullah: Information Commissioner

A. The Appeal

1. The Appellant filed an appeal, dated 29-09-2020, to the Commission, stating that he submitted an information request to Registrar, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad on 31-08-2020 under the Right of Access to Information Act 2017 but did not received any response from the public body.
2. The information sought by the Appellant is as follows:

“I need Merit list for the Post Account Assistant BPS 14 which the interview was held in W.M Zaki Hall Academic Com-plex Islamabad.”

B. Proceedings

3. Through a notice dated November 05, 2020, sent to Ms. Bibi Yasmeen, Assistant Registrar (Establishment) / Public Information Officer, Allama Iqbal Open University, the Commission called upon the Respondent to submit reasons for not providing the requested information.
4. Another notice was issued to the Respondent on December 07, 2020 with the directions to provide reasons in writing within 7 working days of as to why the requested information has not been provided to the applicant.
5. The Respondent through a letter vide F.1-373/2019-Admn/137 dated January 14, 2021 submitted its response which is as under:

“Reference to the Appeal No.674-10/2020 of Mr. Muhammad Sohail S/o Tilawat Shah for providing merit list of Account Assistant (BPS-14) for KPK sent through your letter dated 07.12.2020 regarding the subject matter.

I am directed to inform you that 03 posts of Account Assistants (BPS-14) for KPK Province were advertised. After conducting of written tests, the interviews of the short-listed candidates were conducted by the Selection Committee. The following criteria was adopted by the Selection Committee for the appointment against the subject post:

<i>Qualification</i>	<i>Experience</i>	<i>Test</i>	<i>Interview</i>
<i>Weightage</i>	<i>Weightage</i>	<i>Weightage</i>	<i>Weightage</i>
<i>15 %</i>	<i>10%</i>	<i>60%</i>	<i>15%</i>

As per the merit list, Mr. Muhammad Sohail attained aggregate of 66.70 marks out of 100 and he stood 6th in the merit list, therefore, he was not recommended for appointment against the said post.”

6. Response of the public body was shared with the Appellant on January 19, 2021.
7. Appellant on 10-02-2021 submitted his response to the information shared the public body which is as under:
“With due to the respect that your letter has been received toe on 04/02/2021 , my appeal num 674-10/2020. I am not satisfied from the public body because the information is given to us is just as formality, it is not really answer of my complaint, because I am standing on 2 position in merit list on Account Assistant kpk post.

Sir I want whole recruitment process of all candidates because the procedure is given by public body is just copy its not real report, I am talking about the whole process of recruitment process of the post that how the other candidates are selected mean all marks of all other 3 candidates which is given by public body because it is not reall process.

Dear sir public body say that the criteria is 60% so I got 60 marks then he say higher qualification is 15% marks so I have MBA finance and then he say that experience marks is 10% so l am government servant so where is my eexperience and high qualification marks so how I got 66.70 marks in whole process.

Sir I humbly request to you that I required the whole recruitment process all marks of other 3 candidates which is he taken.

I need a recruitment of 3 candidates and all marks it is not real.”
8. The appeal was fixed for hearing on April 01, 2021 and both parties were inform through a notice sent on March 19, 2021.
9. Ms. Bibi Yasmeen, Public Information Officer, Allama Iqbal Open University attended the hearing held on April 01, 2021, and informed the commission that the requested information is already shared with the appellant. She also shared that the marks allotted to other candidates could only be shared after the detailed judgement of the commission.

C. Discussion and Commission’s View on Relevant Issues

10. This commission holds that the Respondent has only shared the criterion and the position of the Appellant on the merit list.
11. This commission is of the view that spirit of the Right of Access to Information Act 2017 dictates that names of the candidates along with total marks in each category mentioned in the criterion and marks allotted to each candidate should be made public.
12. This commission is also of the view that public bodies should ensure that merit lists containing marks allotted to the candidates and marks for each category should be made available on the web sites to promote transparency in recruitment processes.

D. Order

13. Appeal is allowed. Public Information Officer is directed to share merit list containing marks allotted to the all the candidates and marks for each category *for the Post of Account Assistant, BPS 14, requested by the Appellant within 7 working days of the receipt of this Order with intimation to this office.*
14. Copies of this order be sent to Public Information Officer, Allama Iqbal Open University and the Appellant for information and necessary action.

Mohammad Azam

Chief Information Commissioner

Fawad Malik

Information Commissioner

Zahid Abdullah

Information Commissioner

Announced on:

April 14, 2021

This order consists of 3 (three) pages, each page has been read and signed